

RACHEL S. DOUGHTY
2550 Ninth Street, Suite 204B
BERKELEY, CA 94710
PHONE: 510-900-9502 x2
EMAIL: rdoughty@greenfirelaw.com
WWW.GREENFIRELAW.COM

November 18, 2019

# Via U.S. Mail

Aramark Uniform & Career Apparel, LLC Brad C. Drummond Michael Fadden 424 Blair Avenue Reading, PA 19601 Aramark Uniform & Career Apparel, LLC c/o C T Corporation System 600 North 2nd Street Suite 401 Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101

#### Dear Mr. Drummond and Mr. Fadden:

This firm represents the Association of Flight Attendants-Communications Workers of America ("AFA-CWA") and Maresa Bache (collectively "Noticing Parties") in connection with this notice of violations of California's Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986, which is codified at California Health & Safety Code section 25249.5 et seq. ("Proposition 65"). The AFA-CWA is a non-profit labor organization representing flight attendants employed by airlines across the country, including in California. Maresa Bache is a flight attendant and member of the AFA-CWA.

This letter constitutes notice to the addressees that they have violated and continue to violate provisions of Proposition 65. Specifically, the entities to which this letter is addressed (also listed below) have violated and continue to violate the warning requirement at section 25249.6 of the California Health & Safety Code, which provides, "No person in the course of doing business shall knowingly and intentionally expose any individual to a chemical known to the state to cause cancer or reproductive toxicity without first giving clear and reasonable warning to such individual...."

# Alleged Violators ("Violators"):

Airline Violator	Additional Violators
American Airlines, Inc.	Twin Hill Acquisition Company, Inc. (dba
	Twin Hill corporate Apparel)
	Aramark Uniform & Career Apparel Group,
	Inc.
	Aramark Uniform & Career Apparel, LLC
	Tailored Brands Purchasing, LLC
	PVH Corp.

Proposition 65 Notice Letter November 18, 2019 Page 2 of 4

The Airline Violator is noticed for consumer and occupational exposures; the remaining Violators are noticed for consumer exposures and, to the extent their conduct occurs in the State of California, for occupational exposures. All violators are noticed for environmental exposures to the extent there are neither consumer nor occupational exposures.

Pursuant to California Health & Safety Code section 25249.7, subdivision (d), the Noticing Parties, as defined above, intend to bring an enforcement action against the Violators, or amend their existing action, sixty (60) days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies listed in the attached Certificate of Service have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations. A summary of Proposition 65 and its implementing regulations, prepared by the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, the lead agency designated under Proposition 65, is enclosed with the copy of this notice served on the Violators. The specific details of the violations that are the subject of this Notice are provided below.

# **Description of Violations:**

The Airline Violator is an employer that requires flight attendants and others to wear uniform shirts, pants, and other apparel; all Violators provide these items to people and consumers, including flight attendants.

- <u>Time Period of Exposure:</u> The violations have been occurring since at least September 2016 with regard to Twin Hill uniform apparel and since at least March 21, 2017, with regard to Aramark uniform apparel (including Van Heusen and Eagle-branded articles) and are continuing to this day.
- <u>Provision of Proposition 65 Implicated:</u> This Notice of Violation covers the "warning provision" of Proposition 65, which is found at California Health and Safety Code, section 25249.6.
- <u>Chemical Involved:</u> The name of the listed chemical involved in these noticed violations is formaldehyde (gas). Exposure to formaldehyde (gas) occurs primarily by inhalation from the wearing, storing, and close contact with the uniform garment pieces identified in this Notice. Exposure can also occur through dermal contact and ingestion.
- <u>Types of Products:</u> The specific types of products causing the violations are various pieces of uniform apparel. These include, <u>but are not limited to</u>, the following listed items and items manufactured of the same material as those listed below:

Identified Brand	Item	Style no.	
Twin Hill	Female LS blouse, blue check	460-0191-202	
Twin Hill	Serving garment, charcoal	740-0080-204	
Twin Hill	Female LS blouse, white	460-0200-202	
Van Heusen/Aramark	Women's LS pinpoint white shirt	6172	
Eagle/Aramark	Women's LS pinpoint white shirt	6173	

Twin Hill	Female pant – slim, dark charcoal	320-0145-202
Twin Hill	Female pant – classic, dark charcoal	320-0144-202

- Description of Exposures: This Notice addresses exposures to formaldehyde (gas). Use of the items listed above, as well as other items of the same material, results in human exposures to formaldehyde (gas). Formaldehyde (gas) is released from the garments continuously when they are worn and used in the intended manner over the life and use of the garment. The primary route of exposure for the violations is inhalation while flight attendants and others are wearing the garment(s); exposure can also occur through dermal contact and ingestion. These exposures occur in homes, cars, airports, airplanes and workplaces throughout California where the products are used. No clear and reasonable warning is provided with these products or in the workplace regarding the carcinogenic hazards of wearing the items or specifically of formaldehyde (gas). Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 27, section 25903, subdivision (b)(2)(F), with respect to environmental exposures, you are informed that the exposure for which a warning is required can occur beyond the property owned or controlled by the Violators.
- Notification Regarding Occupational Exposures: Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 27, section 25903 and California Code of Regulations title 8, section 338, subdivision (b), you are informed as follows: This notice alleges the violation of Proposition 65 with respect to occupational exposures governed by the California State Plan for Occupational Safety and Health. The State Plan incorporates the provisions of Proposition 65, as approved by Federal OSHA on June 6, 1997. This approval specifically placed certain conditions with regard to occupational exposures on Proposition 65, including that it does not apply to the conduct of manufacturers occurring outside the State of California. The approval also provides that an employer may use the means of compliance in the general hazard communication requirements to comply with Proposition 65. It also requires that supplemental enforcement is subject to the supervision of the California Occupational Safety and Health Administration. Accordingly, any settlement, civil complaint, or substantive court orders in this matter must be submitted to the Attorney General.

Pursuant to California Code of Regulations, title 11, section 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached.<sup>1</sup>

# **Resolution of Claims Being Noticed**

Based on the allegations set forth in this Notice, the Noticing Parties intend to file a citizen enforcement lawsuit against the Violators or amend their current action unless the Violators agree to remedy the violations set forth above. If the Violators are interested in resolving this

<sup>1</sup> A second copy of the entire notice and Certificate of Merit is served on the Attorney General, clearly marked "Attorney General Copy: Contains Official Information Pursuant to Evidence Code Section 1040" with all supporting documentation required by Section 3102 attached thereto.

Proposition 65 Notice Letter November 18, 2019 Page 4 of 4

dispute without resort to expensive and time-consuming litigation, please contact the Noticing Parties through their counsel identified below.

### **Preservation of Relevant Evidence**

This Notice also serves as a demand that the Violators preserve and maintain all relevant evidence, including all electronic documents and data, pending resolution of this matter. Such relevant evidence includes but is not limited to all documents relating to formaldehyde released from or during the storage, wear, and use of garments identified above; purchases and sales information for such products; communications with any person relating to actual or potential exposures to formaldehyde from the use and wear of such products and garments; and representative exemplars of each unit of any such products sold since September 2016.

#### **Parties**

This Notice is provided on behalf of the following person and organization:

AFA-CWA c/o Ed Gilmartin 501 3<sup>rd</sup> St. NW Washington, DC 20001 (202) 434.1300 Maresa Bache P.O. Box 9142 Tucson, AZ 85738 (520) 990.3542

The Noticing Parties can be contacted through counsel as identified below:

Rachel Doughty **Greenfire Law, PC**2550 9<sup>TH</sup> Street, Ste. 204B

Berkeley, CA 94710
510 900 9502 x2
rdoughty@greenireiaw.com

Sincerely,

Rachel Doughty

cc: Attorney General (without Summary and with additional confidential information supporting Certificate of Merit)

District Attorneys and City Attorneys listed in Certificate of Service (without Summary)

Attachments:

Certificate of Merit

Rankel S. Don hong

Certificate of Service

The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary ("Summary")

### **CERTIFICATE OF MERIT**

California Health & Safety Code § 25249.7(d)

# I, Rachel Doughty, hereby declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that the party identified in the notice has violated Health and Safety Code section 25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am an attorney for the noticing parties.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the alleged exposure to the listed chemical that is the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code section 25249.7(h), *i.e.*, (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

November 18, 2019

Rachel Doughty

Enclosure (Attorney General copy only)

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, am over the age of 18 years and not a party to this case.

X I am a resident of or employed in the county where the mailing occurred and my address in that county
is: 2550 Ninth Street, Berkeley, CA 94710. I am readily familiar with this business's practice for collection and
processing of correspondence for mailing with the United States Post Office.
I am an active member of the State Bar of California (bar number ).

On the date shown below, I caused to be served the following documents:

- NOVEMBER 18, 2019 LETTER RE: NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE SECTION 25249.5 ET SEQ.
- CERTIFICATE OF MERIT
- "THE SAFE DRINKING WATER AND TOXIC ENFORCEMENT ACT OF 1986
- (PROPOSITION 65): A SUMMARY" (served only on alleged violators)
- CERTIFICATE OF MERIT ATTACHMENTS (served only on Attorney General)

by having copies of the same enclosed in sealed envelopes addressed to each of the entities shown below and deposited in the U.S. mail with the postage fully prepaid.

Name and address of each alleged violator to whom documents were mailed:

#### Aramark Uniform & Career Apparel, LLC

Brad C. Drummond, President/COO Michael Fadden, President of Uniform Apparel 424 Blair Avenue Reading, PA 19601

#### Aramark Uniform & Career Apparel, LLC

c/o C T Corporation System 600 North 2nd Street Suite 401 Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101

Name and address of each public prosecutor to whom documents were mailed:

See attached Public Prosecutor Distribution List.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Date: November 18, 2019

Bella T. Fong

# **Distribution List**

The Honorable Nancy O'Malley District Attorney ALAMEDA COUNTY 1225 Fallon Street, Room 900 Oakland, CA 94612	The Honorable Michael Atwell District Attorney ALPINE COUNTY P.O. Box 248 Markleeville, CA 96120	The Honorable Lori Frugoli District Attorney MARIN COUNTY 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130 San Rafael, CA 94903	The Honorable Walter Wall District Attorney MARIPOSA COUNTY P.O. Box 730 Mariposa, CA 95338
The Honorable Todd Riebe District Attorney AMADOR COUNTY 708 Court Street, #202 Jackson, CA 95642	The Honorable Michael Ramsey District Attorney BUTTE COUNTY 25 County Center Drive, Administration Building Oroville, CA 95965	The Honorable C. David Eyster District Attorney MENDOCINO COUNTY P.O. Box 1000 Ukiah, CA 95482	The Honorable Kimberly Lewis District Attorney MERCED COUNTY 550 West Main Street Merced, CA 95340
The Honorable Barbara Yook District Attorney CALAVERAS COUNTY 891 Mountain Ranch Road San Andreas, CA 95249	The Honorable Matthew Beauchamp District Attorney COLUSA COUNTY 346 5th Street, Suite 101 Colusa, CA 95932	The Honorable Samuel D. Kyllo District Attorney MODOC COUNTY 204 S. Court Street Room 202 Alturas, CA 96101	The Honorable Tim Kendall District Attorney MONO COUNTY P.O. Box 2053 Mammoth Lakes, CA 93546
The Honorable Diana Becton District Attorney CONTRA COSTA COUNTY 900 Ward Street Martinez, CA 94553	Katherine Micks District Attorney DEL NORTE COUNTY 450 H Street, Room 171 Crescent City, CA 95531	The Honorable Jeannine M. Pacioni District Attorney MONTEREY COUNTY P.O. Box 1131 Salinas, CA 93902	The Honorable Allison Haley District Attorney NAPA COUNTY P.O. Box 720 Napa, CA 94559
The Honorable Vernon Pierson District Attorney EL DORADO COUNTY 778 Pacific Street Placerville, CA 95667	The Honorable Lisa Smittcamp District Attorney FRESNO COUNTY 2220 Tulare Street, Suite 1000 Fresno, CA 93721	The Honorable Clifford Newell Office of the District Attorney NEVADA COUNTY 201 Commercial Street Nevada City, CA 95959	The Honorable Todd Spitzer District Attorney ORANGE COUNTY 401 Civic Center Drive West Santa Ana, CA 92701
The Honorable Dwayne Stewart District Attorney GLENN COUNTY P.O. Box 430 Willows, CA 95988	The Honorable Maggie Fleming District Attorney HUMBOLDT COUNTY 825 5th Street Eureka, CA 95501	The Honorable R. Scott Owens District Attorney PLACER COUNTY 10810 Justice Center Drive Roseville, CA 95678	The Honorable David Hollister District Attorney PLUMAS COUNTY 520 Main Street, Room 404 Quincy, CA 95971
The Honorable Gilbert G. Otero District Attorney IMPERIAL COUNTY 940 West Main Street, Suite 102 El Centro, CA 92243	The Honorable Thomas L. Hardy District Attorney INYO COUNTY 168 North Edwards Independence, CA 93526	The Honorable Michael Hestrin District Attorney RIVERSIDE COUNTY 3960 Orange Street Riverside, CA 92501	The Honorable Anne Marie Schubert District Attorney SACRAMENTO COUNTY 901 G Street Sacramento, CA 95812
The Honorable Cynthia Zimmer District Attorney KERN COUNTY 1215 Truxtun Avenue Bakersfield, CA 93301	The Honorable Keith Fagundes District Attorney KINGS COUNTY 1400 West Lacey Blvd. Hanford, CA 93230	The Honorable Candice Hooper- Mancino District Attorney SAN BENITO COUNTY 419 4th Street Hollister, CA 95023	The Honorable Jason Anderson District Attorney SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY 303 W. Third Street San Bernardino, CA 92415
The Honorable Susan Krones District Attorney LAKE COUNTY 255 N. Forbes Street Lakeport, CA 95453	The Honorable S. Melyssah Rios  District Attorney  LASSEN COUNTY  2950 Riverside Drive, Suite:102  Susanville, CA 96130	The Honorable Summer Stephan District Attorney SAN DIEGO COUNTY 330 W. Broadway, Suite 1300 San Diego, CA 92101	Suzy Loftus Interim District Attorney SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY 350 Rhode Island Street, North Building, Suite 400N San Francisco, CA 94103
The Honorable Jackie Lacey District Attorney LOS ANGELES COUNTY 211 W. Temple Street, Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90012	The Honorable Sally O. Moreno District Attorney MADERA COUNTY 209 West Yosemite Avenue Madera, CA 93637	The Honorable Tori Verber Salazar District Attorney SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY P.O. Box 990 Stockton, CA 95202	The Honorable Dan Dow District Attorney SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY Courthouse Annex, 4th Floor San Luis Obispo, CA 93408

The Honorable Joyce Dudley District Attorney SANTA BARBARA COUNTY 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101	Los Angeles City Attorney 800 City Hall East 200 N. Main Street Los Angeles, CA 90012	San Francisco City Attorney City Hall, Room 234 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102-4682
The Honorable Jeff Rosell District Attorney SANTA CRUZ COUNTY 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060	Kamala D. Harris California's Office of the Attorney General 455 Golden Gate, Suite 11000 San Francisco, CA 94102-7004	
The Honorable Sandra Groven District Attorney SIERRA COUNTY 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936		
The Honorable Krishna A. Abrams District Attorney SOLANO COUNTY 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533		
The Honorable Birgit Fladager District Attorney STANLISLAUS COUNTY 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95353		
The Honorable Matthew Rogers District Attorney TEHAMA COUNTY P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080		
The Honorable Tim Ward District Attorney TULARE COUNTY 221 South Mooney Blvd., Suite 224 Visalia, CA 93291		
The Honorable Gregory Totten District Attorney VENTURA COUNTY 800 South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009		
The Honorable Clint Curry District Attorney YUBA COUNTY 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901		
San Diego City Attorney Civic Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave. #1620 San Diego, CA 92101		
	District Attorney SANTA BARBARA COUNTY 1112 Santa Barbara Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101  The Honorable Jeff Rosell     District Attorney SANTA CRUZ COUNTY 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060  The Honorable Sandra Groven     District Attorney SIERRA COUNTY 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936  The Honorable Krishna A. Abrams     District Attorney SOLANO COUNTY 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533  The Honorable Birgit Fladager     District Attorney STANLISLAUS COUNTY 832 12th Street, Suite 300     Modesto, CA 95353  The Honorable Matthew Rogers     District Attorney     TEHAMA COUNTY     P.O. Box 519     Red Bluff, CA 96080  The Honorable Tim Ward     District Attorney     TULARE COUNTY 221 South Mooney Blvd., Suite 224     Visalia, CA 93291  The Honorable Clint Curry     District Attorney     VENTURA COUNTY 800 South Victoria Avenue     Ventura, CA 93009  The Honorable Clint Curry     District Attorney     YUBA COUNTY 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152     Marysville, CA 95901  San Diego City Attorney     Civic Center Plaza     1200 3rd Ave. #1620	District Attorney SANTA BARBARA COUNTY 1112 Santa Barbara, CA 93101  The Honorable Jeff Rosell District Attorney SANTA CRUZ COUNTY 701 Ocean Street, Room 200 Santa Cruz, CA 95060  The Honorable Sandra Groven District Attorney SIERRA COUNTY 100 Courthouse Square Downieville, CA 95936  The Honorable Krishna A. Abrams District Attorney SOLANO COUNTY 675 Texas Street, Suite 4500 Fairfield, CA 94533  The Honorable Birgit Fladager District Attorney STANLISLAUS COUNTY 832 12th Street, Suite 300 Modesto, CA 95353  The Honorable Matthew Rogers District Attorney STANLISLAUS COUNTY P.O. Box 519 Red Bluff, CA 96080  The Honorable Gregory Totten District Attorney TULARE COUNTY 221 South Mooney Blvd, Suite 224 Visalia, CA 93291  The Honorable Gregory Totten District Attorney YENTURA COUNTY SOUS South Victoria Avenue Ventura, CA 93009  1 The Honorable Clint Curry District Attorney YUBA COUNTY 215 Fifth Street, Suite 152 Marysville, CA 95901  San Diego City Attorney Civic Center Plaza 1200 3rd Ave. #1620